



TRUST BOARD

Minutes of a Meeting of the Trust Board of South East Cornwall Multi Academy Regional Trust held at Liskeard School and Community College on Wednesday 18th July 2018 at 5.30pm

Present:	Dr S Brownlow	Absent:
	Mr D Buckley, CEO	
	Mr B Cook	
	Mr K George	
	Mr K Johnson	
	Mr J Kitson	
	Mr R Newton Chance, Chair	
	Mrs K Waghorn	

In Attendance: Mrs J Lumbard, CFO
Mrs D Stoneman, Company Secretary and Clerk

To provide evidence of challenge, these questions are highlighted in the minutes.

100. **Welcome**
Mr Newton-Chance welcomed everyone to the meeting, especially Brian Cook as this was his first meeting. Everyone introduced themselves.
101. **Evacuation Procedure**
The route for leaving the building in an emergency was explained.
102. **Declaration of Business and Pecuniary Interest - written**
Forms were completed by all present and handed to the Clerk.
103. **Apologies for Absence**
None as all present. It was noted that Peter Robinson had resigned for personal reasons. An advert for a Director would be prepared and circulated with a closing date of the second week of the Autumn Term. **ACTION: D STONEMAN**
104. **Approval of the minutes of the meeting held on 30th April 2018**
These had been circulated in advance of the meeting. After some changes, these were unanimously agreed as an accurate record of the meeting.
- Directors agreed that the minutes of Trust Board meetings should go on the SMART website and be circulated to Local Governing Committees once approved at the subsequent Trust Board meeting.
105. **Matters Arising**
A document giving details of actions from the last meeting had been updated and circulated in advance.
- M86 Matters Arising:**
M69 Minutes of Local Governing Committees – The Clerk had sent a reminder that ‘Matters for Trust Board attention’ should be included on all LGC agendas.
M72 CFO - Finance Report and update on Resources issues: The cashflow forecast has been circulated.

M74 Director Appointments – Academy Ambassadors have forwarded an application from a potential Member who lives in Somerset. The Members decided that this person is too far away from this area to be able to carry out the current requirements of the role.

M87 Minutes of Local Governing Committees - Dr Brownlow has spoken to the Portfolio Holder who understood the point being raised. Directors were advised that the matter of the ARB staffing is a long way short of being resolved. The point of issue is that there is a dispute between Liskeard School and the Local Authority about the appropriate model of learning for ARB students. The school feel that these students should take part in main school activities when it is appropriate and beneficial. Mr Buckley summarised the issues that had been raised. **A Director asked if they have £200,000 funding attributed to them.** Mr Buckley advised that whatever funding has been allocated is insufficient. **A Director asked for clarification about the withdrawal of these students from the main school.** Mr Buckley advised that the school and MAT are committed to a model that meets the needs of the students. Currently, the high-performing students in the ARB are attending mainstream classes. **A Director asked if parents are being consulted.** Mr Buckley thought they were. He advised that both ARBs (Liskeard and Saltash) are integrated with the schools. Mrs Lumbard advised that the issues at saltash.net are not the same as those at Liskeard. The funding is £30K adrift and the Local Authority will not fund this. Liskeard School will not change the model as they are committed to supporting the students. It was suggested that a letter is sent to the LA from the Board. Mr Buckley was asked to draft this and forward to the Chair for signature. It was suggested that the portfolio holder is invited to the school. **ACTION: D BUCKLEY**

M91 CFO - Finance Report and update on Resources issues – the three year financial projection has been circulated for consideration at this meeting.

M92 CEO - update on People issues – b) Saltash parental complaint – Mr Newton Chance has prepared a document which has been circulated to all schools in the MAT which includes the requirement that an emergency email address is on each school's website. It was noted that a decision on how out of hours contact with the school can be managed needs to be made by the headteacher. It was suggested that a document setting out the requirement for out of hours emergency contact is prepared. **ACTION: D STONEMAN**

M72 Finance Report and update on Resources issues – **A Director asked if there has been any progress with arranging an insurance policy to cover staff absence.** Mrs Lumbard advised that all of the schools now have a policy. For secondaries, this provides cover once a threshold has been reached in order to reduce the premium.

M75 Policies: SMART Reserves & Investment Policy – A Director asked if there has been a review of the investment of cash balances. Mrs Lumbard advised that priority has been given to preparing the budgets so this has yet to be carried out.

M90 CEO – update on Learning Issues – See appendix.

M90c Educational Adviser Visits – the response from the RSC would be circulated again.

ACTION: D STONEMAN

M93 GDPR – Following the appointment of Steve Green as Data Protection Officer (DPO), concern has been expressed that there may be a conflict of interest. It was agreed that the criteria for this appointment should be checked which Mr Kitson offered to do. **ACTION: D STONEMAN/J KITSON**

106. **Minutes of Local Governing Committees**

Dobwalls 15-3-2018; Landulph 14-3-2018, Liskeard 13-3-2018, Looe 12-3-2018, saltash.net 19-3-2018, Trewidland 8-3-2018. Those available had been circulated in advance of the meeting. Those that were not would be circulated when available.

ACTION: D STONEMAN

107. **Points raised by LGCs for follow-up:**

Dobwalls – governors had noted that there has been significant improvement across the board. Following several years of declining results, there has been an improvement this year. Directors

acknowledged this improvement and asked that their thanks be passed on to those concerned. The 2018-19 budget had been agreed.

Landulph – have concerns about increasing pupil numbers and are considering the construction of another classroom. They would also like the Nursery to be on the school site but a decision on this cannot be made until the situation is clear. A Condition Survey needs to be completed for the process of capital allocation. The Headteacher has just advised the school that she is leaving at the end of the Autumn Term. Directors acknowledged the significant contribution she has made to the MAT and wished her well for the future.

Liskeard – Governors were concerned that they did not have sufficient knowledge about teaching and learning and to address this, additional meetings have been scheduled next year. There is ongoing concern with the ARB as previously discussed. **A Director asked if there is a plan in place to address the deficit budget for future years.** It was noted that the budget for 2018/19 is balanced; work will be done in the Autumn Term to manage this going forward.

Looe – New governors are being appointed as four have resigned. Scott Yaldon and Kate Jackman produced an impressive Headteacher’s Report for governors. The budget was recommended for approval. **A Director asked what is happening about the headteacher replacement.** Mr Buckley advised that the LGC are planning to recruit in the Autumn Term with appointment from September 2019. He stated that they are confident with the current leadership arrangement. **A Director asked if this is a Trust Board appointment.** Mr Buckley advised that it is a CEO appointment with LGC and Director representation on the appointment panel. The LGC panel would be heavily involved. **A Director queried whether appointment of these senior post holders should be overseen by the Board.** It was noted that this is not the current policy. It was agreed that a process is needed; Dr Brownlow, Mrs Waghorn and Mr Kitson would discuss this.

ACTION: S BROWNLOW/K WAGHORN/J KITSON

Saltash – There had been a discussion about the lack of statutory policies. The influx of students from Plymouth was a cause of concern and this may impact on the GCSE results for 2019. There are 240 students joining Year 7, which is the school’s PAN. Concern was expressed about the Cleaning Contract. There is a proposal to change the name of the school to become Saltash Community School; the idea of which was well received by the Board.

Trewidland – the budget had been discussed in detail and approval recommended.

108. **Report from Visiting Directors**

Dr Brownlow has attended each school and reported that all six headteachers had been welcoming and she felt it had been an extremely valuable exercise. She commended it to other directors. Mrs Waghorn advised that there has been good progress regarding attendance at Saltash, especially persistent absence. The projected GCSE results are looking positive.

109. **CEO – update on Learning Issues**

Mr Buckley reported that data indicators are good. From this:

a) **Primarys**

There is a common format for data reporting in primary schools which looks at each year group.

Dobwalls has moved forward in all areas. Areas highlighted in red are items still to be improved. It was noted that in the report for Dobwalls last year, all areas would be been red. Leadership at Dobwalls has been considerably enhanced; results are analysed by six staff members for a team approach.

Landulph has also moved forward.

Trewidland – the data is strong; 80% of pupils reached the expected standard and 60% reached higher than. The problems with phonics last year have been resolved this year with the introduction of Read Write Inc.

b) **Secondaries**

Liskeard appears to be slightly down which is cause for concern as the RSC will consider this as forming part of downward trend in results. The Headteacher has looked at this and can provide the finer detail. Mr Buckley advised that if this translates into final results, Liskeard will need to be given a strong focus next year.

According to their projected data, Saltash has made significant progress in all key areas. The Pupil Premium gap has been difficult to move as the students have all progressed at the same rate. Data in Year 7 and Year 8 shows that the gap has been narrowed.

Looe – had a good starting point and have made good progress. An in-depth analysis has revealed that ten students with long-standing issues have had a detrimental effect on the data. This is a group of hard-to-reach students with part of the problem being attendance. If you take these students out of the data, Looe would be leading the entire south west for Pupil Premium students at Progress 8. **A Director asked about the impact of the changes to outliers being made by the DfE.** Mr Buckley felt this could be positive but the detail is not yet known.

- c) **A Director asked if predicted A level results are available.** These will be forwarded. It was noted that more emphasis needs to be given to KS5 in reporting data to the Board.

ACTION: D BUCKLEY

- d) **A Director asked why the writing at KS2 is below the national benchmark for all primary schools.** Mr Buckley advised that it was above in two of the schools last year; there is a fluctuation in how writing is assessed and it is proving difficult to move this forward. At Landulph this is attributed to one child who has done well in other subjects. **A Director asked if there is a strategy in place to improve this.** Mr Buckley advised that all the English leads will be working together next year; he outlined the strategies they are considering. At Trewidland this is also attributed to one child. Dobwalls is close to the average for a school that was so far behind.

- e) **A Director felt it was difficult for the Board to consider data without consistent reporting and would like to see a whole MAT report for both primary and secondary. They asked if there is a data system in place to produce this.** Mr Buckley advised that the primary schools now have a common assessment system for reporting and data across every year group.

- f) Work has started to align departments in the secondary schools but this is proving more difficult. English Departments are all using the same exam board but their curricula varies significantly. It was noted that directors have access to ASP and FFT although this is historic data. The Maths and English Departments have committed to a common assessment system for the coming year. Mr Buckley felt this would be a significant achievement. A system had been purchased and used by the Maths department but the results it provided were not found to be meaningful.

- g) **A Director felt that the document provided to Directors contained too much information and would like a summary including comparison with previous years.** Mr Buckley highlighted the RAG rated sheet produced for each school showing in red where all the issues are. **Directors felt that they need to know what the issues are and what is being done about them.** A Director suggested that there is a committee which looks at this in detail. Mr Buckley suggested that the heads produce key issues and he will bring this to the Board. The Clerk suggested that there needs to be a specific agenda item for the CEO Report in future.

- h) Peer Review Reports – reports for Looe and Trewidland had been circulated in advance of the meeting. Mr Buckley outlined the peer review process which is carried out at each school

once a year. A detailed discussion followed; from this:

- i) Looe - There had been a positive report; the current management team are doing a good job. No significant negative issues had been raised.
- j) A Director felt that the two reports (Looe and Trewidland) follow a different format. Mr Buckley advised that the Looe review needed to be different and he gave the reasons why. **A Director expressed concern about the marked difference in tone.** Mr Buckley advised that the RSC had indicated that these reports were not hard-hitting enough where there were clear issues which needed addressing. It was noted that they are collaboratively shared with headteachers. The heads have advised that they find it a constructive process.
- k) See appendix.
- l) The Business case for the Trewidland budget would be circulated. **ACTION: J LUMBARD**
- m) There was a detailed discussion of how and when this information should be advised to governors and staff. It was agreed that they should be advised that the Board are strongly considering the option of an Executive Head model for Landulph and Trewidland which is option 2 in the Business Case. The Clerk was asked to draft this for circulation on Friday. **ACTION: D STONEMAN**
- n) Saltash – a Director asked if the problems discussed at previous meetings are under control. Mr Buckley advised that significant progress has been made. Data indicates that results will improve. Attendance has definitely improved and leadership capacity has been developed. The Headteacher has worked extremely hard to realise in-year savings for the budget.

110. **Establishing a Finance and Teaching & Learning Committee**

Directors agreed that there should be a Finance Committee but the decision made regarding a Teaching & Learning Committee should be considered at a future meeting when the impact of the Finance Committee can be assessed.

It was agreed that the members of the Finance Committee would be – Mr Cook, Mr Kitson, Mr George and Mr Newton Chance. The Clerk was asked to send Mr Cook specimen terms of reference.

ACTION: D STONEMAN

Mr Newton Chance asked Link Directors to review their allocated policies.

ACTION: ALL LINK DIRECTORS

111. **CFO - Finance Report and update on Resources issues**

A report and the completed KPI sheet had been circulated in advance of the meeting. From this:

- a) Mrs Lumbard advised that the budget needs to be agreed for submission to the ESFA next week. A balanced budget for SMART overall has been prepared. Looe have set a deficit in year budget but they have reserves to cover this.
- b) **A Director expressed concern about the level of reserves.** This will be considered by the Finance Committee. **ACTION: FINANCE COMMITTEE**
- c) **A Director asked about the projection going forward that 5 of the 6 schools will have deficit budgets.** Mrs Lumbard advised that work to address this will be commenced in the Autumn Term. **A Director asked if the ESFA will express concern about the future deficit budgets.** Mrs Lumbard advised that they just want to see an overall picture and know what is being done. This is the first time that a return has had to be submitted to the ESFA on future years.

- d) Mrs Lumbard advised that all Local Governing Committees had recommended their respective budgets for approval. Directors unanimously approved the SMART budget. *It subsequently transpired that recommendation of the Liskeard budget for 2018-19 had been delegated to a sub-committee which had not met.*
- e) The Clerk would liaise regarding the dates of Finance Committee meetings. Mrs Lumbard would check eligibility for membership of the Finance Committee with Bishop Fleming and the Academies Financial Handbook. **ACTION: D STONEMAN/J LUMBARD**

112. **Audit Procedure**

Mr Newton Chance advised that the procedure for the appointment of the auditors has been resolved. **A Director asked about the details.** As the Members are responsible for the appointment of the auditors, they have agreed that the tendering process should be held next year.

A Director advised that as the auditors would need to carry out tests during the year, the appointment needs to be effective from the beginning of the academic year. The Audit Committee made a recommendation to the Members that a tendering process should be carried out to determine the appointment of the auditors for the next financial year. At their subsequent meeting, having taken account of the practicalities of this, the Members made a decision to go with current arrangements with a tendering process being held before September 2019. Members will be involved in this process.

Directors asked for it to be noted that they wholeheartedly supported the principle of transparency.

113. **CBU Funding**

This would be looked at in detail by the Finance Committee. Mr Buckley advised that he has attended the LGC meetings and this has been raised. A Director asked if LGCs see the whole SMART budget and whether each of the schools are aware of the detailed budget of the other schools. Mrs Lumbard advised that they are not. **ACTION: FINANCE COMMITTEE**

114. **Capital Funding and allocation process**

This would also be looked at by the Finance Committee. Mrs Lumbard plans to prepare the procedure during the holiday. It was noted that condition data for each school will be needed. Directors asked for this information to be emailed to them when available.

ACTION: FINANCE COMMITTEE/J LUMBARD

115. **CEO - update on People issues**

A summary document was circulated. From this:

- a) See appendix.

Mr George left the meeting.

- b) Union Recognition – the document which had been circulated was unanimously agreed.
- c) Support Staff Pay Policy – it was noted that there had not been a response from staff support unions and the policy had been agreed by the HR LGC link governors. This policy was unanimously agreed. **A Director asked if national rates are paid to support staff.** They are. It was noted that these staff do not currently have contribution related pay.
- d) Statutory Policies - All HR policies have been considered by the Board and LGCs and were frozen when the Trade Unions expressed concerns. They will be forwarded in batches of seven to LGCs. It was noted that the Wolverstans' policies are significantly different from the ones provided by the Local Authority. **A Director felt that we should revert to the LA policies and make them applicable to the current structure.** Mr Buckley advised that the SMART policies are an amalgamation of the LA policies and the Wolverstans' ones. The HR Director

requested a schedule setting out the current situation. Mr Buckley advised that this has already been circulated and would be re-circulated.

ACTION: D STONEMAN

Three HR policies will be considered at each union meeting. Mr Buckley thanked the HR Director for their input. He outlined the process; the initial policies have already been agreed by LGCs and the Trust Board and will be the first ones to be sent to the unions. In future policies will be agreed by the Unions first, then sent to LGCs for comments within two weeks and then the Trust Board for approval. It was noted that this will need to be documented in the Scheme of Delegation.

ACTION: D BUCKLEY

Mr Buckley and Mrs Lumbard left the meeting.

116. **CEO and CFO ISR**

Mr Newton Chance advised that he has circulated a document relating to the pay scales for both posts. He outlined the options he was recommending which he felt was a fair way to treat these categories of staff. He highlighted that this is not related to performance. After a detailed discussion, it was suggested and agreed that the Remuneration Committee consider the matter in detail.

ACTION: REMUNERATION COMMITTEE

The membership of the Remuneration Committee was confirmed as Dr Brownlow as HR Director; Mr Cook as Finance Director and Mr Newton Chance as Chair of the Trust Board.

117. **Relationship with Members**

A document prepared by Mr Martin after discussions with the Chair had been circulated in advance of the meeting and was noted. The Chair urged Directors to read the document and return any comments to him.

118. **Director/Governor appointment: consider requesting references**

After a brief discussion, it was agreed that references should be requested for all future governor and director appointments. The procedure for doing this will be considered at a later date.

ACTION: R NEWTON CHANCE/ D BUCKLEY

119. **Confirmation that Directors have considered the following -**

<https://www.gov.uk/government/news/charity-automatic-disqualification-rules-you-can-now-apply-for-a-waiver>
Those present advised that they had read the above link and had nothing further to declare.

120. **GDPR - Governors' email addresses**

At the LGC meetings there had been confusion about the permissible methods of accessing school-based email addresses as it had been highlighted that the responsible organisation has the authority to delete all material on devices used to access these emails. There had also been differences in the advice issued to governors in different schools. Directors agreed that consistency across the MAT is needed concerning this. The Clerk was asked to prepare a draft guidance document for checking by the CEO and DPO.

ACTION: D STONEMAN

121. **Adoption of Policies: Financial Scheme of Delegation**

This was referred to the Finance Committee.

ACTION: FINANCE COMMITTEE

122. **Calendar of Meetings 2018-19**

This had been circulated in advance of the meeting. Directors were asked to let the Clerk know if they were not able to attend any meeting on the suggested date.

123. **Dates and times of future meetings**

These are shown on the calendar. It was agreed that Audit Link meetings and Strategies for Teaching and Learning are on the agenda for the next meeting.

The meeting closed at 8.50 pm.

SUMMARY OF ACTIONS	
M103 Apologies for Absence - An advert for a Director would be prepared and circulated with a closing date of the second week of the Autumn Term.	D STONEMAN
M105 Matters Arising: M87 Minutes of Local Governing Committees - It was suggested that a letter is sent to the LA from the Board. Mr Buckley was asked to draft this and forward to the Chair for signature. It was suggested that the portfolio holder is invited to the school. M92 CEO - update on People issues – b) Saltash parental complaint – It was suggested that a document setting out the requirement for out of hours emergency contact is prepared. M90c Educational Adviser Visits – the response from the RSC would be circulated again. M93 GDPR – Following the appointment of Steve Green as Data Protection Officer (DPO), concern has been expressed that there may be a conflict of interest. It was agreed that the criteria for this appointment should be checked which Mr Kitson offered to do.	D BUCKLEY D STONEMAN D STONEMAN D STONEMAN /J KITSON
M106 Minutes of Local Governing Committees - Dobwalls 15-3-2018; Landulph 14-3-2018, Liskeard 13-3-2018, Looe 12-3-2018, saltash.net 19-3-2018, Trewidland 8-3-2018. Those available had been circulated in advance of the meeting. Those that were not would be circulated when available.	D STONEMAN
M107 Points raised by LGCs for follow-up: Looe - A Director asked what is happening about the headteacher replacement. Mr Buckley advised that the LGC are planning to recruit in the Autumn Term with appointment from September 2019. A Director asked if this is a Trust Board appointment. Mr Buckley advised that it is a CEO appointment with LGC and Director representation on the appointment panel. A Director queried whether appointment of these senior post holders should be overseen by the Board. It was noted that this is not the current policy. It was agreed that a process is needed; Dr Brownlow, Mrs Waghorn and Mr Kitson would discuss this.	S BROWNLOW/ K WAGHORN/ J KITSON
M109 CEO – update on Learning Issues - A Director asked if predicted A level results are available. These will be forwarded.	D BUCKLEY
M110 Establishing a Finance and Teaching & Learning Committee - It was agreed that the members of the Finance Committee would be – Mr Cook, Mr Kitson, Mr George and Mr Newton Chance. The Clerk was asked to send Mr Cook specimen terms of reference. Mr Newton Chance asked Link Directors to review their allocated policies.	D STONEMAN ALL LINK DIRECTORS
M111 CFO - Finance Report and update on Resources issues – b) A Director expressed concern about the level of reserves. This will be considered by the Finance Committee. e) The Clerk would liaise regarding the dates of Finance Committee meetings. Mrs Lumbard would check eligibility for membership of the Finance Committee with Bishop Fleming and the Academies Financial Handbook.	FINANCE COMMITTEE D STONEMAN /J LUMBARD
M113 CBU Funding - This would be looked at in detail by the Finance Committee.	FINANCE COMMITTEE
M114 Capital Funding and allocation process This would also be looked at by the Finance Committee. Mrs Lumbard plans to prepare the procedure during the holiday. It was noted that condition data for each school will be needed. Directors asked for this information to be emailed to them when available.	FINANCE COMMITTEE/ J LUMBARD

<p>M115 CEO - update on People issues d) Statutory Policies - The HR Director requested a schedule setting out the current situation. Mr Buckley advised that this has already been circulated and would be re-circulated.</p> <p>Mr Buckley outlined the policy review process; the initial policies have already been agreed by LGCs and the Trust Board and will be the first ones to be sent to the unions. In future policies will be agreed by the Unions first, then sent to LGCs for comments within two weeks and then the Trust Board for approval. It was noted that this will need to be documented in the Scheme of Delegation.</p>	<p>D STONEMAN</p> <p>D BUCKLEY</p>
<p>M116 CEO and CFO ISR - It was suggested and agreed that the Remuneration Committee determine a policy for senior staff.</p>	<p>REMUNERATION COMMITTEE</p>
<p>M118 Director/Governor appointment: consider requesting references After a brief discussion, it was agreed that references should be requested for all future governor and director appointments. The procedure for doing this will be considered at a later date.</p>	<p>R NEWTON CHANCE D BUCKLEY</p>
<p>M120 GDPR - Governors' email addresses - Directors agreed that consistency across the MAT is needed concerning this. The Clerk was asked to prepare a draft guidance document for checking by the CEO and DPO.</p>	<p>D STONEMAN</p>
<p>M121 Adoption of Policies: Financial Scheme of Delegation - This was referred to the Finance Committee.</p>	<p>FINANCE COMMITTEE</p>